Analyzing Arguments pt 2

Source 1= <https://www.glamour.com/story/a-complete-breakdown-of-the-jk-rowling-transgender-comments-controversy>

| Claim 1 | What started the main controversy JK rowling is Facing |
| --- | --- |
| Evidence | “If sex isn’t real, there’s no same-sex attraction. If sex isn’t real, the lived reality of women globally is erased. I know and love trans people, but erasing the concept of sex removes the ability of many to meaningfully discuss their lives. It isn’t hate to speak the truth,” she tweeted. “The idea that women like me, who’ve been empathetic to trans people for decades, feeling kinship because they’re vulnerable in the same way as women—i.e., to male violence—‘hate’ trans people because they think sex is real and has lived consequences—is a nonsense.”  Rowling retweeted an op-ed piece that discussed “people who menstruate,” apparently taking issue with the fact that the story did not use the word *women.* “‘People who menstruate.’ I’m sure there used to be a word for those people. Someone help me out. Wumben? Wimpund? Woomud?” she wrote.  “I respect every trans person’s right to live any way that feels authentic and comfortable to them. I’d march with you if you were discriminated against on the basis of being trans. At the same time, my life has been shaped by being female. I do not believe it’s hateful to say so.” |
| Commentary | Rowling [explains](https://www.jkrowling.com/opinions/j-k-rowling-writes-about-her-reasons-for-speaking-out-on-sex-and-gender-issues/) that she became interested in trans issues while researching a character she’s writing. Rowling also outlined “five reasons for being worried about the new trans activism.”  The book reportedly follows a detective on the hunt for a cis male serial killer who dresses as a woman in order to hunt and murder cis women. [The *Telegraph*’s review](https://www.telegraph.co.uk/books/what-to-read/troubled-blood-robert-galbraith-review-jk-rowling-fails-strike/) describes it as a “book whose moral seems to be: never trust a man in a dress,” |
| Claim 2 | This has affected many other celebrities she id related with and it has also exposed many of their ow opinions. |
| Evidence | “but that is really not what this is about, nor is it what’s important right now. While Jo is unquestionably responsible for the course my life has taken, as someone who has been honored to work with and continues to contribute to The Trevor Project for the last decade, and just as a human being, I feel compelled to say something at this moment. Transgender women are women. Any statement to the contrary erases the identity and dignity of transgender people and goes against all advice given by professional health care associations who have far more expertise on this subject matter than either Jo or I. According to The Trevor Project, 78% of transgender and nonbinary youth reported being the subject of discrimination due to their gender identity. It’s clear that we need to do more to support transgender and nonbinary people, not invalidate their identities, and not cause further harm."  “I firmly stand with the trans community and echo the sentiments expressed by many of my peers. Trans women are women. Trans men are men,” Grint [said](https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/weald-school-drops-jk-rowling-from-its-house-names-after-transphobia-row-shlm9gbh6), according to the *Sunday Times* on Friday, June 12, 2020. “We should all be entitled to live with love and without judgment.”  ‘Men often react to women’s words—speaking and writing—as if they were acts of violence; sometimes men react to women’s words with violence,’” Rowling [tweeted](https://twitter.com/jk_rowling/status/1277265589782929410) on June 28, 2020. “It isn’t hateful for women [to] speak about their own experiences, nor do they deserve shaming for doing so.” |
| Commentary | In response, Rowling sent a now-deleted tweet praising the author. “I’ve always revered @StephenKing, but today my love reached—maybe not Annie Wilkes levels—but new heights,” she reportedly tweeted, [according to *Us Weekly*](https://www.usmagazine.com/celebrity-news/news/j-k-rowling-deletes-stephen-king-tweet-after-he-supports-trans-women/). “It’s so much easier for men to ignore women’s concerns, or to belittle them, but I won’t ever forget the men who stood up when they didn’t need to. Thank you, Stephen.”  However, when a fan asked King to respond to Rowling’s transphobic statements, the author replied that, “Trans women are women.” |
| Claim 3 | Rowling in response to her hatred attempts to defend herself. |
| Evidence | “I’ve ignored fake tweets attributed to me and RTed widely. I’ve ignored porn tweeted at children on a thread about their art. I’ve ignored death and rape threats. I’m not going to ignore this,” Rowling wrote. “When you lie about what I believe about mental health medication and when you misrepresent the views of a trans woman for whom I feel nothing but admiration and solidarity, you cross a line.” |
| Commentary | he once again seemingly called into question the use of hormones. |

Source 2: <https://www.advocate.com/transgender/2021/12/13/jk-rowling-casts-transphobic-tweets-again>

| Claim 1 | Rowling has [made many anti-trans comments previously,](https://www.advocate.com/people/2020/6/06/jk-rowling-goes-full-terf-new-series-transphobic-tweets) claiming to love trans people but also essentially questioning their existence |
| --- | --- |
| Evidence | made statements that were supportive of trans-exclusionary radical feminists, a.k.a. TERFs, and defended a woman who lost her job because of anti-trans rhetoric. |
| Commentary | She has painted trans rights as somehow in conflict with women’s rights, and some conservative politicians have used Rowling’s comments to support their transphobic positions. |

Source 3:

| Claim 1 |  |
| --- | --- |
| Evidence |  |
| Commentary |  |
| Claim 2 |  |
| Evidence |  |
| Commentary |  |
| Claim 3 |  |
| Evidence |  |
| Commentary |  |